

## MINUTES

### **13th Annual Meeting of the Board of Directors of the Asian Ombudsman Association (AOA)**

**Date 5<sup>th</sup> December, 2011**

**Venue: Tokyo, Japan.**

**List of participants is attached.**

In his opening remarks, Ms. Conchita Carpio Morales, Vice President, Asian Ombudsman Association (AOA), welcomed all BoD members. Ms. Ma Wen, Minister, Ministry of Supervision, Peoples Republic of China and Mr. Mostafa Pour Mohammadi, President, General Inspection Organization, Islamic Republic of Iran could not attend the meeting and were represented by Mr. Huawei Zhang, Commissioner (Vice Minister) Ministry of Supervision, Peoples Republic of China and Dr. G. Bolandian, Deputy for Planning and Resource Management, General Inspection Organization, Islamic Republic of Iran.

#### **Agenda Item No.1**

#### **Approval of agenda for the present (13th) annual meeting of the Board of Directors of the AOA**

The Executive Secretary AOA presented before the Board the draft agenda for the current meeting for approval.

#### **Decision:**

The agenda proposed by the AOA Secretariat was approved for discussion.

#### **Agenda Item No. 2**

#### **Approval of the minutes of the last (12th) meeting of the Board of Directors held at Manila, Philippines on 26<sup>th</sup> August, 2010.**

The Executive Secretary AOA requested the Board to consider and confirm the minutes of the 12<sup>th</sup> annual meeting of the Board held at Manila, Philippines on 26<sup>th</sup> August, 2010.

#### **Decision:**

The minutes were approved.

### **Agenda Item No. 3**

#### **Implementation Report on the decisions of the last (12th) meeting of the Board of Directors.**

The Executive Secretary presented the implementation status/progress on the decisions taken in the last meeting of the Board.

2. The Board of Directors reviewed the progress in detail. The following points came up for discussion:

- (i) No action was required against item no's 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 9(i), 11(i).
- (ii) Item No. 6(i) The application processing fee is still outstanding. The Office of the Institution of the Human Rights Defender of the Republic of Armenia intimated to pay the fee in 2012.
- (iii) Item No. 6(ii), 8 & 12(i) The recommendations of the BoD will be placed before the General Assembly in its meeting scheduled on 8th December, 2011.
- (iv) Item No. 9(ii), 10 & 11(ii) are being discussed as separate agenda items in the current meeting.
- (v) Item No. 12(ii) The application processing fee has been received and the Executive Committee accepted the recommendations of the AOA Secretariat to accept the membership of the Public Defender of Georgia for Associate Membership, as provision of the security of tenure is there in the relevant law.
- (vi) Item No.13(i) All concerned have been informed about the grant of honorary life membership of AOA to Mr. Javed Sadiq Malik and membership roster has been updated. And he has been invited to attend the 12th AOA conference

#### **Decision:**

The Board showed its satisfaction over the implementation status of the decisions taken in the last meeting.

### **Agenda Item No. 4**

#### **Report of the President on the activities of the Association in terms of clause 5-5(i) of the Code of Conduct of Business of the AOA.**

As per clause 5-5 (i) of the Code of Conduct of Business of the AOA, an annual report on the activities of the Association, including a report of the activities of the AOA Secretariat, was presented by the President before the Board.

2. Salient features of the activities as briefed by the Executive Secretary AOA are as follows:

- (i) Successful execution and completion of RETA project.
  - Capacity building interventions:
  - Study tours, training secondments and retreats.
  - Knowledge products:

- Cross country studies and policy paper examining important themes and issues relating to Ombudsmanship’
  - Adoption of Core Principles of Ombudsmanship.
- (ii) Interaction with the Ombudsmen worldwide on issues of mutual interest.

Ms. Youngran Kim, Chairperson of the Anti-Corruption & Civil Rights Commission (ACRC), Republic of Korea and Mr. Asad Ashraf Malik, Ombudsman Sindh, Pakistan were elected as members of BoD of IOI from Asian Region.

- (iii) Finances and Utilization.

Expenditure during the year remained within the budget allocations. Financial position of the Association remained sound.

**Decision:**

The Board noted the progress and showed its satisfaction over the Association’s performance during the last one year.

**Agenda Item No. 5**

**Consideration of applications for membership of the AOA from:-**

- i The Commissioner for Human Rights (Ombudsman), Republic of Azerbaijan.**
- ii. Office of the Ombudsman (Provedoria) for Human Rights and Justice, Democratic Republic of Timor-Leste.**
- iii. The Commissioner for Human Rights, Republic of Tatarstan.**

The Offices of the institutions of the Commissioner for Human Rights (Ombudsman) Republic of Azerbaijan, the Ombudsman (Provedoria) for Human Rights and Justice, Democratic Republic of Timor and the Commissioner for Human Rights, Republic of Tatarstan had applied for full membership of the AOA. The Executive Committee of the Board while considering the working paper prepared by the AOA Secretariat recommended to the Board of Directors to accept all the applications.

**Decision:**

The Board of Directors approved to recommend to the General Assembly to accept the full membership applications of the Offices of the institutions of the Commissioner for Human Rights (Ombudsman) Republic of Azerbaijan, the Ombudsman (Provedoria) for Human Rights and Justice, Democratic Republic of Timor and the Commissioner for Human Rights, Republic of Tatarstan.

## **Agenda Item No. 6**

### **Audit report of the AOA accounts.**

The Treasurer AOA Ms. Kim Young-ran, Chairperson, Anti-Corruption & Civil Rights Commission (ACRC), Korea placed the audit reports prepared by M/s W.A Associates, for the period 1<sup>st</sup> January to 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2010, before the Board of Directors. The treasurer also placed on record the financial position of AOA accounts, while showing her satisfaction and also suggested some measures to improve the financial base of income of the Association.

### **Decision:**

The Board approved the placement of the audit reports before the General Assembly and also showed its satisfaction on the financial position of the Association.

## **Agenda Item No. 7**

### **Approval of the expenditure for the year 2011 and budget proposals for 2012.**

The AOA Secretariat prepared the detail of expenditures for 2011 requiring ex-post facto approval of the Board alongwith the budget proposals for 2012 requiring the approval of the Board for future expenditure.

### **Decision:**

The Board gave ex-post facto approval of the expenditure incurred during the year 2011 and approved the budget proposals for the year 2012 unanimously, as per following details.

Sr. No.	Items	( In US\$)	
		Expenditure During 2011	Budget Proposals For 2012
1	Remuneration of Manager Coordination	US\$ 6977	US\$ 6,800
2	Telephone, fax, internet & web hosting & maintenance charges, postal & courier service charges, Stationery and Office equipments	US\$ 1,000	US\$ 1,000
3	Fee for the Auditors	US\$ 500	US\$ 500
4	Print Library & Resource Centre	US\$ 1,100	US\$ 1,500
5	Printing	US\$ 536	US\$ 1,000
6	Travelling, Boarding & Lodging		US\$ 6,000
7	Miscellaneous expenditure	US\$ 450	US\$ 1,500
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>US\$ 10,563</b>	<b>US\$ 18,300</b>

### **Agenda Item No. 8**

(Carried over from 12<sup>th</sup> annual meeting of the B.O.D)

#### **Consideration of working paper prepared by the General Inspection Organization, Islamic Republic of Iran, on establishment of academy and office of cultural group.**

In compliance with the BoD decision given in its last meeting held on 26<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 at Manila, Philippines, the General Inspection Organization, Islamic Republic of Iran submitted, a working paper on its proposal elaborating the objectives, structure, services and mode of finance on the issues of creation of an academy under the aegis of the AOA and establishment of an office of a cultural group in Iran, for consideration of the Board.

2. The AOA Secretariat observed that since the TOR's contained in the working paper are broad in nature, therefore, requires further discussions to chalk out detail with respect to objectives, methodology, source of financing, implanting & over sighting mechanism. In view of the position it was suggested that a committee consisting of the BoD members & officials of AOA Secretariat may be formed which may visit Tehran for further study, negotiations, drafting the TOR's and letter of agreement for consideration and approval of the BoD.

#### **Decision:**

The Board of Directors discussed the details of working paper and decided that new Board of Directors may further discuss the issue in its meeting and decides accordingly.

### **Agenda Item No. 9**

(Carried over from 12<sup>th</sup> annual meeting of the B.O.D)

#### **Use of AOA Funds.**

In its last Meeting held at Manila, Philippines, on 26<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 the Board observed that the AOA Secretariat may draft a working paper for the next Board meeting containing proposals for utilization of funds for launching the programs and activities furthering the objectives of the AOA including learning and adopting best practices identified in the survey conducted under RETA Project through training programs.

2. Accordingly, AOA Secretariat placed a working paper before the Board discussing objectives, methodology, source of financing, implementing & over sighting mechanism, for the program on utilization of AOA funds for consideration and approval.

**Decision:**

The Board after discussing the objectives, methodology, source of financing, implementing & over sighting mechanism of the program proposed by the AOA Secretariat, on utilization of AOA funds in detail and decided that new Board of Directors may further discuss the issue in its meeting and decides accordingly.

**Agenda Item No. 10**

**Consideration of proposals for hosting the annual meeting of the Board of Directors in 2012 and 13<sup>th</sup> AOA Conference in 2013.**

On invitation of the AOA Secretariat for proposals to host next annual meeting of the Board of Directors in 2012 and 13<sup>th</sup> Conference of the AOA in 2013, the Provincial Mohtasib (Ombudsman) Sindh, Pakistan offered to host the next annual meeting of the BoD in 2012 at Karachi, Pakistan and the General Inspection Organization, Islamic Republic of Iran offered to host the 13<sup>th</sup> AOA conference in Tehran, Iran. Both the proposals received to the AOA Secretariat were discussed in detail.

**Decision:**

The Board of Directors accepted with thanks, the offer of the General Inspection Organization, Islamic Republic of Iran to host the 13<sup>th</sup> AOA Conference in Tehran, Iran and recommended to the General Assembly for ratification of the decision. Regarding offer to host the next Board meeting in 2012 the Board decided that the new Board of Directors may further discuss the issue in its meeting and decides accordingly.

**Agenda Item No. 11**

**Elections of the office holders and members of the Board of Directors of the AOA.**

During the 10th meeting of the general Assembly held on 2007 at Hanoi Vietnam, elections of the Board were held. The terms of office holders and members expiring expiring, hence new elections were required. Accordingly, in terms of Clause II Sub-Clause 2-1 and 2-2 of the Code of Conduct of the Association, the nominations for all offices on the Board were invited.

2. The position was as follows;-

- (a) No nomination for the post of President is received.
- (b) Only one nomination of Ms. Conchita C. Morales i.e, the Ombudsman of Philippines was received against the post of the Vice President.

- (c) Only one nomination had been received for the post the of Secretary i.e Mr. Alan Lai, the Ombudsman of Hong Kong.
- (d) Only one nomination had been received for the post the of Treasurer i.e. Ms. Kim Young-ran, Chairperson Anti-Corruption & Civil Rights Commission, Republic of Korea.
- (e) Six nominations were received against five posts of the members of the Board of Directors, i.e.
  1. Ms. Ma Wen,  
Minister, Ministry of Supervision, Peoples Republic of China.
  2. Mr. Hiedo Arai  
Director General, Administrative Evaluation Bureau, Japan
  3. Justce Pour Muhammadi  
Government Inspection Organization, Islamic republic of Iran.
  4. Dr. Fong Man Chong  
Commissioner for Commission Against Corruption, Macao, SAR, China
  5. Dr. Tam Weng Wah, Director General,  
Public Complaints Bureau, Malaysia
  6. Mrs. Panit Nitithanprapas,  
The Chief Ombudsman of Thailand

**Decision:**

For the position of the President AOA, the Board of Directors, as provided in clause 9(1) of the Bye Laws of AOA, had been pleased to resolve recommending to the General Assembly to adopt and ratify the following Resolution:-

- “(a) if the Wafaqi Mohtasib (Federal Ombudsman) of Pakistan is appointed by 31 May 2012, he or she shall be invited to be the President of AOA; and
- (b) if no person is appointed to the post of Wafaqi Mohtasib (Federal Ombudsman) Pakistan by 31 May 2012, or if the Wafaqi Mohtasib declines the invitation, the Board of Directors shall determine how the post of the President of AOA is filled.”

2. The Board forwarded the nominations papers received against all other posts to the Executive Committee for scrutiny as envisaged in Article 2-6 of the Code of Conduct of Business of the AOA for the election on 8<sup>th</sup> December, 2011.

**Agenda Item No. 12**

**Approval of the arrangements for 12<sup>th</sup> AOA Conference and agenda of the General Assembly meeting scheduled from 6<sup>th</sup> to 8<sup>th</sup> December, 2011.**

The arrangements made and the programme finalized by the host, i.e. the Administrative Evaluation Bureau (AEB), of the 12th AOA Conference alongwith draft agenda for the 12<sup>th</sup> General Assembly was placed before the Board for approval.

**Decision:**

The Board approved the arrangements made and the programme finalized by the host, as well as draft agenda for the 12<sup>th</sup> General Assembly for discussion.

**Agenda Item No. 13**

**Any other items, which any member of the Board of Directors may like to discuss.**

The Executive Secretary AOA pointed out that in the absence of President AOA who is also the joint signatory of the AOA bank accounts alongwith the Executive Secretary, no financial transaction had been possible for the AOA Secretariat to meet the financial expenditure incurred therein. Therefore, the liability to the tune of US\$9322 has become accrued. It was proposed that the Administrator AOA alongwith Executive Secretary may be authorized to jointly operate the accounts of the AOA as joint signatory. So, that the liabilities may be cleared and future expenditures may be met as per approved budget.

**Decision:**

The Board decided that in future in the absence of the President AOA, the Executive Secretary and Administrator AOA will jointly operate the AOA bank accounts to meet financial obligations of the Association.

2. The success of the 12<sup>th</sup> Asian Ombudsman Association Conference held at Tokyo, Japan on 6<sup>th</sup> & 8<sup>th</sup> December, 2011, could not be possible without the whole hearted cooperation and support provided by the host country through the Director General, Administrative Evaluation Bureau, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications (MIC), staff of the office and all ranks of the other departments of the Government. The warm hospitability and generosity extended to the delegates and participants whose needs and comforts have been fully attended to, has made the Conference memorable and extremely enjoyable;

3. Accordingly, in recognition of the efforts and hard work of his Excellency Mr. Hideo Arai, Director General and the Office of the Director General, Administrative Evaluation, Bureau, Japan the Board also placed on record its thanks and appreciation for the arrangements and hospitability of Mr. Hideo Arai, Director General, Administrative Evaluation Bureau, Japan, the deputies, staff of the office and all ranks of his department.



## **LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

### **13TH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS OF THE AOA 5<sup>th</sup> DECEMBER, TOKYO, JAPAN**

#### **VICE PRESIDENT**

Ms. Conchita Carpio Morales, National Ombudsman, Philippines.

#### **SECRETARY**

Mr. Alan N. Lai, Ombudsman, Hong Kong, SAR China.

#### **TREASURER**

Ms. Youngran Kim, Chairperson, Anti Corruption and Human Rights Commission, Republic of Korea.

#### **MEMBERS**

Mr. Huawei Zhang, Commissioner (Vice Minister) Ministry of Supervision, Peoples Republic of China

Dr. G. Bolandian, Deputy for Planning and Resource Management, General Inspection Organization, Islamic Republic of Iran.

Mr. Hideo Arai, Director General, Administrative Evaluation Bureau, Japan

Dr. Tam Weng Wah, Director General, Public Complaints Bureau, Prime Minister's Department, Malaysia.

Mrs. Panit Nitithanprapas, Chief Ombudsman, Thailand

#### **EXECUTIVE SECRETARY**

Khawaja Muhammad Naeem, Secretary, W. M. Secretariat, Pakistan.

#### **ADMINISTRATOR**

Mr. Abdur Rauf Khan, Director, W. M. Secretariat, Pakistan.